

Commission canadienne

CMD 24-M41

Date: 2024-10-28 File / dossier : 6.02.04 Edocs pdf : 7394080

Update from CNSC Staff

Mise à jour du personnel de la **CCSN**

Updates on items from previous **Commission meetings**

Mise à jour des points abordés lors des réunions précédentes de la Commission

Commission Meeting

Réunion de la Commission

November 7, 2024

7 novembre 2024





MEMORANDUM

NOTE DE SERVICE

To Candace Salmon

A Commission Registrar

Security Classification - Classification de sécurité UNCLASSIFIED Our File – Notre référence : e-Doc #; e-Doc 7276988 (Word) e-Doc 7375182 (PDF) Your File 4.01.02 Fully releasable ATIP - Entièrement publiable AIPRP : Yes/Oui / No/Non

2024-10-08

From De

Alexandre Viktorov Director General-DPRR Signed by: Viktorov, Alexandre

Subject: Commission Action from Bruce Power Mid-term Update of Licensed Activities Commission Meeting – CNSC Staff's Responses to the Recommendations from CMD 23-M27.29, Nuclear Transparency Project Written Intervention

ISSUE/QUESTION

Following the Bruce Power Mid-term Update of Licensed Activities Commission Meeting on September 20, 2023, the Commission placed one action on CNSC staff to provide responses to the recommendations in the Nuclear Transparency Project (NTP) written intervention CMD 23-M27.29 [1]. NTP's submission consisted of 20 recommendations within the main body of the submission that were directed at CNSC and/or Bruce Power; the recommendations were associated with various subjects, including but not limited to public information and disclosure, and environmental data reporting. There were also 15 more recommendations included in Appendix A, originally from a NTP submission prepared for the CNSC-Environment and Climate Change Canada (ECCC)-Environmental Non-Governmental Organizations (ENGO) National Pollutant Release Inventory (NPRI) working group. The Commission members had expressed interest in the applicability of all the recommendations, and had requested that CNSC and Bruce Power address them as part of a future proceeding.

This action was specified in item #33 from the Commission meeting minutes [2]. The purpose of this memo is to address this action by providing the Commission with CNSC staff's responses to the recommendations.

Results from Review of NTP Recommendations

The CNSC project team that worked toward addressing this Commission action and developing the responses consisted of staff from the following divisions:

- Bruce Regulatory Program Division (BRPD)
- Health Sciences and Environmental Compliance Division (HSECD)



- Corporate and Regulatory Communications Division (CRCD)
- Indigenous and Stakeholder Relations Division (ISRD)
- Commission Registry

Table 1 below includes all NTP recommendations from the submission that were applicable to CNSC and/or Bruce Power. For the recommendations directed at CNSC, the responses include if CNSC staff are or are not accepting the recommendation by indicating if changes to current processes or practices will be made at this time, if corresponding actions are required, and rationale for each decision. In addition, for the recommendations directed at Bruce Power, the responses include if there are concerns related to nuclear safety or with Bruce Power's compliance in the areas of public information and disclosure or environmental data reporting, and if CNSC staff expect Bruce Power to address anything, and the rationale supporting this.

Responses to the NTP recommendations from Appendix A of the submission, *NTP submissions to CNSC-ECCC-ENGO NPRI Working Group*, were also included. The reason for this is item #33 with the action from the minutes of the Commission meeting [2] specifically mentions "...Nuclear Transparency Project's recommendations aiming at making current disclosures of data on the Open Government Portal more user friendly." The NTP recommendations in Appendix A directly relate to improving the Open Government Portal and making the radionuclide data more user-friendly and informative.

The Commission meeting transcript [3], page 164, indicates that CNSC staff expressed to the Commission that their intentions with addressing these recommendations depends on their relation to safety. Though responses were prepared for all recommendations, CNSC staff used this as a contributing factor when considering acceptance and/or initiating changes and actions for the recommendations.

Table 1: CNSC Staff's Responses to the Recommendations from CMD-23-M27.29, Nuclear Transparency Project Written Intervention

CMD 23-M27.29, Nuclear Transparency Project (NTP) Submission Section and/or	CNSC Staff Response
Recommendation	
Main body of NTP submission	
Indigenous jurisdiction and the CNSC's regulatory context (Page 3)	Applicable to: CNSC
	*Not framed as a recommendation, so no formal
	acceptance; however, CNSC staff identified a need to respond.
	The CNSC is not a rights-determining body. The CNSC encourages Indigenous Nations and communities to outline the nature and scope of the rights and interests that they
	feel may be adversely affected by a proposed project or activity regulated by the CNSC. The CNSC also encourages
	them to bring forward any issues and concerns throughout the EA and/or licensing process.
	CNSC staff work closely with Indigenous Nations and
	communities to understand if any potential adverse impact



	on Indigenous rights or interests arises from a CNSC environmental assessment or licensing decision, and also work collaboratively to address those concerns to the greatest extent possible while ensuring that the CNSC upholds the honour of the Crown and meet its consultation obligations. This can include the development a mutually agreeable arrangement for consultation and engagement for specific projects and regulatory processes with potentially impacted Nations.
Concerns with qualifying language in REGDOC- 3.2.1	Applicable to: CNSC
Recommendation 1: that CNSC consider an impact-based approach to licensee disclosure requirements rather than a risk-based approach. (Page 5)	CNSC staff do not accept this recommendation. Risk-informed regulating is the overall approach taken by the CNSC. Risk is factored into the CNSC's regulatory framework as well as its licensing, compliance and enforcement activities. CNSC makes science- and evidence- based decisions and takes risk-informed regulatory actions.
	To be consistent with this overall approach, REGDOC-3.2.1, <i>Public Information and Disclosure,</i> Section 2, Public Information Program, Subsection 2.1, Overview, states that "the public information program and its disclosure protocol shall be commensurate with the public's perception of risk and the level of public interest in the licensed activities."
	Risk is not the only requirement for disclosure in REGDOC- 3.2.1. The public's interest, and relevance of the licensed activities which may impact the communities or identified target audiences are also key factors in the licensee's decision to disclose information.
	CNSC staff note that REGDOC-3.2.1 is currently undergoing review. NTP is invited to provide further information about this recommendation in their review of the discussion paper, which is currently open for public review and comment, and in the upcoming stakeholder workshop to which NTP will be invited.
Evaluation of Bruce Nuclear compliance with REGDOC 3.2.1	Applicable to: Bruce Power
Recommendation 2: that Bruce Nuclear amend their target audiences to broaden the term "charities" either by using the term "civil society organizations" instead or else the phrase "charities and non-profit organizations". (Page 6)	As a part of the Public Information and Disclosure Program (PIDP), licensees are required to review their program regularly. This could include reviewing tactics, audiences, messaging and implementing any changes, modifications to the program that would improve or enhance the effectiveness of their programs. It would be beneficial and inclusive to broaden the target audience language to



	include "civil society organizations", however it is not
	necessary to continue to meet its PIDP requirements.
	Bruce Power is compliant with the PIDP requirements set
	out in REGDOC-3.2.1. Bruce Power may wish to consider
	this recommendation for continuous improvement.
Bruce Nuclear's Public Information Program	Applicable to: CNSC
, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	
Recommendation 3: that CNSC staff ensure	CNSC staff do not accept this recommendation.
communications to students and schools concern	
the science of nuclear energy generation rather	In alignment with the CNSC mandate to disseminate
than arguments relating to its necessity or	objective scientific, technical, and regulatory information to
desirability. (Page 6)	the public, all CNSC communications and outreach to
desirability. (Fage 0)	-
	Indigenous Nations and communities, members of the
	public, and stakeholders are, and will continue to be
	objective, technology-agnostic, and non-promotional of
	nuclear.
	Bruce Power's education content and outreach messaging
	addresses their own public education objectives as an
	independent nuclear organization. Bruce Power is meeting
	their PIDP and public outreach obligations, of which CNSC
	staff have not identified any safety or regulatory concerns.
Bruce Nuclear's Public Information Program	Applicable to: Bruce Power
Recommendation 4: that Bruce Nuclear include	Bruce Power is currently meeting requirements for posting
on its webpage how often its public information	their PIDP information online. As a part of the PIDP,
is revised and how public inquiries will be	licensees are required to review their program regularly.
responded to and recorded. (Page 6)	Bruce Power could choose to indicate when the PIDP was
	last updated and if any significant changes/improvements
	were made, but this is not a requirement.
	Bruce Power is compliant with the PIDP requirements set
	out in REGDOC-3.2.1. Bruce Power may wish to consider
	this recommendation for continuous improvement.
Bruce Nuclear's Public Disclosure Protocol	Applicable to: Bruce Power
Recommendation 5: that Bruce Nuclear include a	CNSC staff note that this is not a DIDD requirement and
	CNSC staff note that this is not a PIDP requirement, and
commitment to publicly disclose machine-	that Bruce Power is compliant with the PIDP requirements
readable disaggregated data and monitoring	set out in REGDOC-3.2.1. Bruce Power may wish to consider
locations in its Public Disclosure Protocol. (Page	this recommendation for continuous improvement to their
7)	PIDP.
Bruce Nuclear's Public Disclosure Protocol	Applicable to: Bruce Power
Recommendation 6: that Bruce Nuclear disclose	REGDOC-3.2.1 outlines guidance for a public disclosure
the criteria it uses for determining when	protocol. Though licensees should strive to be open and
information or reports are published online.	transparent in their relations with community
(Page 7)	



	,
	representatives, target audiences and the public, disclosing
	these criteria is not a specific PIDP requirement.
	Bruce Power is compliant with the PIDP requirements set
	out in REGDOC-3.2.1. Bruce Power may wish to consider
	this recommendation for continuous improvement to their
	PIDP.
Bruce Nuclear's Public Disclosure Protocol	Applicable to: Bruce Power
Recommendation 7: that Bruce Nuclear explicitly	CNSC staff note that this is not a PIDP requirement, and
commit in its Public Disclosure Protocol to notify	that Bruce Power is compliant with the PIDP requirements
members of the public via social media whenever	set out in REGDOC-3.2.1. Bruce Power may wish to consider
an event report is posted to its website. (Page 7)	this recommendation for continuous improvement to their
	PIDP.
Comments on Bruce Nuclear's disclosure	Applicable to: Bruce Power
practices – Environmental Protection Reports	
	CNSC staff note that there is no reporting requirement in
Recommendation 8: that Bruce Nuclear release	version 2 of REGDOC-3.1.1, Reporting Requirements for
disaggregated data with annual Environmental	Nuclear Powerplants, for Bruce Power to report
Protection Reports (Page 8)	disaggregated data with annual Environmental Protection
	Reports. CNSC staff request and review disaggregated data
	from Bruce Power during compliance inspections.
	from Brace Fower during compliance inspections.
	Bruce Power may wish to consider this recommendation for
	continuous improvement to their environmental reporting.
Comments on Bruce Nuclear's disclosure	Applicable to: Bruce Power
	Applicable to. bluce Power
practices – Environmental Protection Reports	CNICC staff note that there is no reporting requirement in
	CNSC staff note that there is no reporting requirement in
Recommendation 9: that Bruce Nuclear release	version 2 of REGDOC-3.1.1 for Bruce Power to report data
disaggregated data in machine readable	in machine readable formats. However, in version 3 of
formats along with its EPRs (Page 8)	REGDOC-3.1.1, there is a requirement for licensees of
	nuclear power generating stations to provide their effluent
	and emissions data in machine readable format in their
	quarterly safety performance indicator report.
	Bruce Power is currently expected to follow the reporting
	requirements of version 2 of REGDOC-3.1.1; however,
	when version 3 is implemented, CNSC staff will be
	expecting Bruce Power to provide effluent and emissions
	data in machine readable format.
Comments on Bruce Nuclear's disclosure	
	Applicable to: Bruce Power
practices – Environmental Protection Reports	CNISC staff note that there is no negative requirement in
	CNSC staff note that there is no reporting requirement in
Recommendation 10: that Bruce Nuclear release	version 2 of REGDOC-3.1.1 for Bruce Power to provide
detailed monitoring locations along with any raw	detailed monitoring locations in the annual environment
data released (preferably as geographical	report. However, Bruce Power is required to implement an
coordinates, if available) (Page 9)	environmental monitoring program that meets the
	requirements in CSA N288.4, Environmental monitoring



programs at Class I nuclear facilities and unnum mines and mills. This environmental monitoring program must contain the detailed monitoring locations. CNSC staff review the program are summarized in the annual report on environmental protection.Comments on Bruce Nuclear's disclosure practices – Environmental Protection ReportsBruce Power may wish to consider this recommendation for continuous improvement to their environmental reporting.Comments on Bruce Nuclear's disclosure practices – Environmental Protection ReportsApplicable to: Bruce PowerRecommendation 11: that Bruce Nuclear provide diagrams of groundwater flow as well as the currents and flow directions of monitored surface water (Page 9)CNSC staff note that there is no reporting requirement in versino 2 of REGDC-3.1.1 for Bruce Power to provide diagrams of groundwater flow. CNSC staff request this infraction activities.Recomments on Bruce Nuclear's disclosure practices – Environmental Protection ReportsBruce Power may wish to consider this recommendation for continuous improvement to their environmental reporting.Comments on Bruce Nuclear's disclosure practices – Environmental Protection ReportsCNSC staff do not accept this recommendation.CNSC staff consider releasing radiological data it his every or grays. This is because the equipment and methodologies used by licensees detect the total amount of activity in the emission or effluent stream.It is difficult to report releases to the environment in sievers or grays. This is because the environment in sis evers or		
continuous improvement to their environmental reporting.Comments on Bruce Nuclear's disclosure practices – Environmental Protection ReportsApplicable to: Bruce PowerRecommendation 11: that Bruce Nuclear provide diagrams of groundwater flow as well as the currents and flow directions of monitored surface water (Page 9)CNSC staff note that there is no reporting requirement in versino 2 of REGDOC-3.1.1 for Bruce Power to provide diagrams of groundwater flow. CNSC staff request this information from Bruce Power during compliance verification activities.Comments on Bruce Nuclear's disclosure practices – Environmental Protection ReportsBruce Power may wish to consider this recommendation.Cost Staff consider releasing radiological data with Sievert or Gray units so that the public may better assess the significance of reported values for ecological and human receptors. (Page 9)CNSC staff release radiological data is received from the licensees.Radiological and human receptors. (Page 9)It is difficult to report releases to the environment in sieverts or grays. This is because the link between sieverts and becquerels because the equipment and methodologies used by licensees detect the total amount of activity in the emission or effluent stream.It is difficult to report releases to the environment in sieverts or grays. This is because the link between sieverts and becquerels is the environmental transport model that is described in CSA N288.1-20, Guidens for modeling radionuclide environmental transport model that is described in CSA N288.1-20, Guidens for modeling radionuclide environmental transport model that is described in CSA N288.1-20, Guidens for modeling radionuclide environmental transport model that is described in CSA nagrue simplifications<		<i>mills</i> . This environmental monitoring program must contain the detailed monitoring locations. CNSC staff review the program during desktop reviews. The results of these programs are summarized in the annual report on
practices – Environmental Protection Reports Recommendation 11: that Bruce Nuclear provide diagrams of groundwater flow as well as the currents and flow directions of monitored surface water (Page 9)CNSC staff note that there is no reporting requirement in version 2 of REGD0C-3.1.1 for Bruce Power to provide diagrams of groundwater flow. CNSC staff request this information from Bruce Power during compliance verification activities.Comments on Bruce Nuclear's disclosure practices – Environmental Protection ReportsBruce Power may wish to consider this recommendation for 		
Recommendation 11: that Bruce Nuclear provide version 2 of REGDOC-3.1.1 for Bruce Power to provide diagrams of groundwater flow, as well as the currents and flow directions of monitored surface information from Bruce Power during compliance water (Page 9) Bruce Power may wish to consider this recommendation for continuous improvement to their environmental reporting. Comments on Bruce Nuclear's disclosure practices – Environmental Protection Reports Applicable to: CNSC and Bruce Power Recommendation 12: that Bruce Nuclear and CNSC staff release radiological data with Siever tor Gray units so that the public may better assess the significance of reported values for ecological and human receptors. (Page 9) CNSC staff release radiological data in the same format that is received from the licenses. Rediological and human receptors. (Page 9) Radiological releases are measured and reported in becquerels because the equipment and methodologies used by licensees detect the total amount of activity in the emission or effluent stream. It is difficult to report releases to the environment in sieverts or grays. This is because the link between sieverts and becquerels is the environmental transport model that is described in CSA N288.1-20, Guidelines for modelling. Comments on Bruce Nuclear's disclosure practices – Environmental Protection Reports Applicable to: Bruce Power Comments on Bruce Nuclear's disclosure practices – Environmental Protection Reports CNSC staff not that the total amount of activity to a dose. Therefore, there is a lot of conservatism in the calculated doses to account for any uncertaint		
diagrams of groundwater flow as well as the currents and flow directions of monitored surface water (Page 9)diagrams of groundwater flow. CNSC staff request this information from Bruce Power during compliance verification activities.Comments on Bruce Nuclear's disclosure practices – Environmental Protection ReportsBruce Power may wish to consider this recommendation for continuous improvement to their environmental reporting.CNSC staff consider releasing radiological data with Sievert or Gray units so that the public may better assess the significance of reported values for ecological and human receptors. (Page 9)CNSC staff release radiological data in the same format that is received from the licensees.Radiological releases are measured and reported in becquerels because the equipment and methodologies used by licensees detect the total amount of activity in the emission or effluent stream.It is difficult to report releases to the environment in sieverts or grays. This is because the link between sieverts and becquerels is the environmental transport, fate, and exposure associated with the normal operation of puclear facilities. This model relies on many assumptions and simplifications to convert the total amount of activity to a dose. Therefore, there is a lot of conservatism in the calculated doses to account for any uncertainties.Comments on Bruce Nuclear's disclosure practices – Environmental Protection ReportsCNSC staff note that the total amount of activity to a dose. Therefore, there is a lot of conservatism in the calculated doses to account for any uncertainties.Comments on Bruce Nuclear's disclosure practices – Environmental Protection ReportsCNSC staff note that the total mass of hazardous substances that are above the reporting thresh	Pecommendation 11: that Bruce Nuclear provide	· - ·
currents and flow directions of monitored surface water (Page 9)information from Bruce Power during compliance verification activities.Bruce Power may wish to consider this recommendation for continuous improvement to their environmental reporting.Bruce Power may wish to consider this recommendation for continuous improvement to their environmental reporting.Comments on Bruce Nuclear's disclosure practices – Environmental Protection ReportsApplicable to: CNSC and Bruce PowerRecommendation 12: that Bruce Nuclear and CNSC staff consider releasing radiological data with Sievert or Gray units so that the public may better assess the significance of reported values for ecological and human receptors. (Page 9)CNSC staff release radiological data in the same format that is received from the licensees.Radiological releases the significance of reported values for ecological and human receptors. (Page 9)Radiological releases are measured and reported in becquerels because the equipment and methodologies used by licensees detect the total amount of activity in the emission or effluent stream.It is difficult to report releases to the environment in sieverts or grays. This is because the link between sieverts and becquerels is the environmental transport model that is described in CSA N288.1-20, <i>Guidelines for modelling radionuclide environmental transport, fate, and exposure associated with the normal operation of nuclear facilities.</i> This model relies on many assumptions and simplifications to convert the total amount of activity to a dose. Therefore, there is a lot of conservatism in the calculated doses to account for any uncertainties.Comments on Bruce Nuclear's disclosure practices – Environmental Protection ReportsApplicable to: Bruce Power </td <td></td> <td></td>		
water (Page 9)verification activities.Bruce Power may wish to consider this recommendation for continuous improvement to their environmental reporting.Comments on Bruce Nuclear's disclosure practices – Environmental Protection ReportsRecommendation 12: that Bruce Nuclear and CNSC staff consider releasing radiological data with Sievert or Gray units so that the public may better assess the significance of reported values for ecological and human receptors. (Page 9)Recommendation 12: that Bruce Nuclear and CNSC staff consider releasing radiological data with Sievert or Gray units so that the public may better assess the significance of reported values for ecological and human receptors. (Page 9)Rediological eleases are measured and reported in becquerels because the equipment and methodologies used by licensees detect the total amount of activity in the emission or effluent stream.It is difficult to report releases to the environment in sieverts or grays. This is because the link between sieverts and becquerels is the environmental transport model that is described in CSA N288.1-20, Guidelines for modelling radionuclide environmental transport, fate, and exposure associated with the normal operation of nuclear facilities. This model relies on many assumptions and simplifications to convert the total amount of activity to a dose. Therefore, there is a lot of conservatism in the calculated doses to account for any uncertainties.Comments on Bruce Nuclear's disclosure practices – Environmental Protection ReportsApplicable to: Bruce PowerRecommendation 13: that Bruce Nuclear provide mass and concentration values for measured released contaminants.Applicable to: Bruce Power (NPRI). This data is		
continuous improvement to their environmental reporting.Comments on Bruce Nuclear's disclosure practices – Environmental Protection ReportsApplicable to: CNSC and Bruce PowerRecommendation 12: that Bruce Nuclear and CNSC staff consider releasing radiological data with Sievert or Gray units so that the public may better assess the significance of reported values for ecological and human receptors. (Page 9)CNSC staff release radiological data in the same format that is received from the licensees.Radiological releases are measured and reported in becquerels because the equipment and methodologies used by licensees detect the total amount of activity in the emission or effluent stream.It is difficult to report releases to the environment in sieverts or grays. This is because the link between sieverts and becquerels is the environmental transport model that is described in CSA N288.1-20, Guidelines for modelling radionuclide environmental transport, fate, and exposure associated with the normal operation of nuclear facilities. This model relies on many assumptions and simplifications to convert the total amount of activity to a dose. Therefore, there is a lot of conservatism in the calculated doses to account for any uncertainties.Comments on Bruce Nuclear's disclosure practices – Environmental Protection ReportsApplicable to: Bruce PowerRecommendation 13: that Bruce Nuclear provide mass and concentration values for measured released contaminants.Applicable to: Bruce Power		
practices – Environmental Protection ReportsCRecommendation 12: that Bruce Nuclear and CNSC staff consider releasing radiological data with Sievert or Gray units so that the public may better assess the significance of reported values for ecological and human receptors. (Page 9)CNSC staff release radiological data in the same format that is received from the licensees.Rediological and human receptors. (Page 9)Radiological releases are measured and reported in becquerels because the equipment and methodologies used by licensees detect the total amount of activity in the emission or effluent stream.It is difficult to report releases to the environment in sieverts or grays. This is because the link between sieverts and becquerels is the environmental transport model that is described in CSA N288.1-20, <i>Guidelines for modelling radionuclide environmental transport, fate, and exposure associated with the normal operation of nuclear facilities.</i> This model relies on many assumptions and simplifications to convert the total amount of activity to a dose. Therefore, there is a lot of conservatism in the calculated doses to account for any uncertainties.Comments on Bruce Nuclear's disclosure practices – Environmental Protection ReportsApplicable to: Bruce PowerRecommendation 13: that Bruce Nuclear provide mass and concentration values for measured released contaminants.Applicable to: Environment and Climate Change Canada's National Pollutant Release Inventory (NPRI). This data is		
Recommendation 12: that Bruce Nuclear and CNSC staff consider releasing radiological data with Sievert or Gray units so that the public may better assess the significance of reported values for ecological and human receptors. (Page 9)CNSC staff release radiological data in the same format that is received from the licensees.Radiological and human receptors. (Page 9)Radiological releases are measured and reported in becquerels because the equipment and methodologies used by licensees detect the total amount of activity in the emission or effluent stream.It is difficult to report releases to the environment in sieverts or grays. This is because the link between sieverts and becquerels is the environmental transport model that is described in CSA N288.1-20, <i>Guidelines for modelling radionuclide environmental transport, fate, and exposure associated with the normal operation of nuclear facilities.</i> This model relies on many assumptions and simplifications to convert the total amount of activity to a dose. Therefore, there is a lot of conservatism in the calculated doses to account for any uncertainties.Comments on Bruce Nuclear's disclosure practices – Environmental Protection ReportsApplicable to: Bruce PowerRecommendation 13: that Bruce Nuclear provide mass and concentration values for measured released contaminants.Applicable to: Bruce PowerNational Pollutant Release Inventory (NPRI). This data is		
CNSC staff consider releasing radiological data with Sievert or Gray units so that the public may better assess the significance of reported values for ecological and human receptors. (Page 9)CNSC staff release radiological data in the same format that is received from the licensees.Radiological releases are measured and reported in becquerels because the equipment and methodologies used by licensees detect the total amount of activity in the emission or effluent stream.It is difficult to report releases to the environment in sieverts or grays. This is because the link between sieverts and becquerels is the environmental transport model that is described in CSA N288.1-20, Guidelines for modelling radionuclide environmental transport, fate, and exposure associated with the normal operation of nuclear facilities. This model relies on many assumptions and simplifications to convert the total amount of activity to a dose. Therefore, there is a lot of conservatism in the calculated doses to account for any uncertainties.Comments on Bruce Nuclear's disclosure practices – Environmental Protection Reports Recommendation 13: that Bruce Nuclear provide mass and concentration values for measured released contaminants.Applicable to: Bruce Power reported to Environment and Climate Change Canada's National Pollutant Release Inventory (NPRI). This data is		CNSC staff do not accept this recommendation.
for ecological and human receptors. (Page 9)Radiological releases are measured and reported in becquerels because the equipment and methodologies used by licensees detect the total amount of activity in the emission or effluent stream.It is difficult to report releases to the environment in sieverts or grays. This is because the link between sieverts and becquerels is the environmental transport model that is described in CSA N288.1-20, Guidelines for modelling radionuclide environmental transport, fate, and exposure associated with the normal operation of nuclear facilities. This model relies on many assumptions and simplifications to convert the total amount of activity to a dose. Therefore, there is a lot of conservatism in the calculated doses to account for any uncertainties.Comments on Bruce Nuclear's disclosure practices – Environmental Protection ReportsApplicable to: Bruce PowerRecommendation 13: that Bruce Nuclear provide mass and concentration values for measured released contaminants.Applolutant Release Inventory (NPRI). This data is	CNSC staff consider releasing radiological data with Sievert or Gray units so that the public may	-
sieverts or grays. This is because the link between sieverts and becquerels is the environmental transport model that is described in CSA N288.1-20, Guidelines for modelling radionuclide environmental transport, fate, and exposure associated with the normal operation of nuclear facilities. This model relies on many assumptions and simplifications to convert the total amount of activity to a dose. Therefore, there is a lot of conservatism in the calculated doses to account for any uncertainties.Comments on Bruce Nuclear's disclosure practices – Environmental Protection ReportsApplicable to: Bruce PowerRecommendation 13: that Bruce Nuclear provide mass and concentration values for measured released contaminants.Autom the total mass of hazardous substances that are above the reporting thresholds are reported to Environment and Climate Change Canada's National Pollutant Release Inventory (NPRI). This data is		becquerels because the equipment and methodologies used by licensees detect the total amount of activity in the
practices – Environmental Protection Reports Recommendation 13: that Bruce Nuclear provide mass and concentration values for measured released contaminants. CNSC staff note that the total mass of hazardous substances that are above the reporting thresholds are reported to Environment and Climate Change Canada's National Pollutant Release Inventory (NPRI). This data is		sieverts or grays. This is because the link between sieverts and becquerels is the environmental transport model that is described in CSA N288.1-20, <i>Guidelines for modelling</i> <i>radionuclide environmental transport, fate, and exposure</i> <i>associated with the normal operation of nuclear facilities</i> . This model relies on many assumptions and simplifications to convert the total amount of activity to a dose. Therefore, there is a lot of conservatism in the calculated doses to
Recommendation 13: that Bruce Nuclear provide mass and concentration values for measured released contaminants.CNSC staff note that the total mass of hazardous substances that are above the reporting thresholds are reported to Environment and Climate Change Canada's National Pollutant Release Inventory (NPRI). This data is		Applicable to: Bruce Power
Recommendation 13: that Bruce Nuclear provide mass and concentration values for measured released contaminants.substances that are above the reporting thresholds are reported to Environment and Climate Change Canada's National Pollutant Release Inventory (NPRI). This data is	practices – Environmental Protection Reports	·····
mass and concentration values for measured released contaminants.reported to Environment and Climate Change Canada's National Pollutant Release Inventory (NPRI). This data is		
released contaminants. National Pollutant Release Inventory (NPRI). This data is	•	



	Bruce Power may wish to consider this recommendation for continuous improvement to their environmental reporting.
Comments on Bruce Nuclear's disclosure	Applicable to: Bruce Power
practices – Environmental Risk Assessments	
	CNSC staff note that there is no reporting requirement in
Recommendation 14: that Bruce Nuclear	version 2 of REGDOC-3.1.1 for Bruce Power to provide this
consider providing raw machine-readable	information. However, this information is requested by
monitoring data and geographic coordinates for monitoring locations featured in its ERAs so that	CNSC staff during compliance verification activities, such as the review of the ERA, to verify that the environmental
data can be analyzed alongside the data available	monitoring data is within predictions and that the
in annual EPRs.	environment is protected.
	Bruce Power may wish to consider this recommendation for
	continuous improvement to their environmental reporting.
Comments on Bruce Nuclear's disclosure	Applicable to: Bruce Power
practices – Online interactive applications	
disclosing environmental monitoring data.	CNSC staff note that there is no requirement for how to
	disclose monitoring data using an online interactive
Recommendation 15: that Bruce data apps	application.
clearly define the scope (and any limitations or boundaries) of their data.	Bruce Power may wish to consider this recommendation for
boundaries) of their data.	continuous improvement to their environmental reporting.
Comments on Bruce Nuclear's disclosure	Applicable to: CNSC
practices – Online interactive applications	
disclosing environmental monitoring data.	CNSC staff do not accept this recommendation.
-	
Recommendation 16: that CNSC staff consult	This recommendation is outside the scope of the CNSC's
the second second fills as helds at the second	

scope of the CNSC's mandate and authority. REGDOC-3.2.1 does not prescribe with members of the public, civil society organizations, and Indigenous Nations, how, or which apps a licensee should use to communicate communities and organizations about how to with its audiences. CNSC staff encourage licensees to strive regulate new online apps developed by licensees for openness and transparency in their relations with to communicate environmental data. (Page 11) Indigenous Nations and communities, local community representatives, target audiences and the public. Licensees should seek to gain an understanding of what information their audiences wish to know and how they would prefer to receive it. CNSC staff review licensees' practices to ensure that the information is available, appropriate and transparent. Areas for further disclosure in the future **Applicable to: Bruce Power** Recommendation 17: that Bruce Nuclear CNSC staff note that there is no reporting requirement in consider publicly disclosing further (preferably version 2 of REGDOC-3.1.1 for Bruce Power to provide data raw and machine-readable) data relating to related to impingement and entrainment monitoring impingement and entrainment monitoring results results as they are collected. CNSC staff request and review as they are collected. (Page 12) this information from Bruce Power during compliance inspections.



	Bruce Power may wish to consider this recommendation for continuous improvement to their environmental reporting.
Areas for further disclosure in the future	Applicable to: Bruce Power
Recommendation 18: that Bruce Nuclear consider publicly disclosing more information relating to its "green bonds", including exactly how proceeds are allocated according to Bruce's Green Financing Framework. (Page 12)	CNSC staff note that this information is not part of the CNSC's environmental protection framework. Therefore, CNSC staff do not review it and there is no reporting requirement. Bruce Power may wish to consider this recommendation for
	continuous improvement to their environmental reporting.
Areas for further disclosure in the future	Applicable to: Bruce Power
Recommendation 19: that Bruce Nuclear provide more information on the progress of its Carbon Offset Accelerator Fund as it continues, including any data relating its outcomes and predicted success. (Page 12)	CNSC staff note that this information is not part of the CNSC's environmental protection framework. Therefore, CNSC staff do not review it and there is no reporting requirement.
	Bruce Power may wish to consider this recommendation for
NTP concerns over intervention timeframes.	continuous improvement to their environmental reporting.
NTP concerns over intervention timetrames.	Applicable to: CNSC
Recommendation 20: that future mid-term	CNSC staff do not accept this recommendation.
licence update meetings provide six months to a year for intervention processes. (Page 13)	The CNSC's current approach to intervention periods is outlined in REGDOC-3.4.1, <i>Guide for Applicants and</i> <i>Intervenors Writing CNSC Commission Member Documents,</i> Section 1.6.2, Submission timelines, which sets the intervention timeframe at 30-60 business days. CNSC staff note that these timelines apply to Commission hearings; however, they are generally applicable to Commission meeting items that also include public participation.
	The CNSC Registry has taken the suggestion of longer timelines, including for mid-term updates, under advisement; however, at this time, longer timelines will only be considered on a case-by-case basis. Broader procedural changes may be considered in the future.

Recommendations to make current disclosures of data on the Open Government Portal more user friendly

Recommendation 1: Explanations of uploaded	CNSC staff accept this recommendation.
radionuclide data (Page 16)	
	On the CNSC Open Government portal, there are
	references to the CNSC's Regulatory Oversight Report



	(ROR), where the user can obtain a more detailed
	explanation of the data.
	Based on this, CNSC staff have not identified a need to implement changes in this area or initiate formal actions for this recommendation at this time.
Recommendation 2: Contextualizing radionuclide	CNSC staff accept this recommendation.
data with maps of stacks and effluent discharge (Page 17)	This feature is already available. The user can map the radionuclide loading data in the Federal Geospatial Platform.
	Based on this, CNSC staff have not identified a need to implement changes in this area or initiate formal actions for this recommendation at this time.
Recommendation 3: Accessible 'errata' notes on	CNSC staff accept this recommendation.
accompany datasets (Page 17)	CNSC staff have taken steps to improve in this area. In 2023, the CNSC published a new spreadsheet that contains any errata that were identified in a previous version of the datasets.
	Based on the efforts made to-date, CNSC staff have not identified a need to initiate formal actions for this recommendation at this time.
Recommendation 4: Automatization to avoid	CNSC staff accept this recommendation.
human error (Page 17)	CNSC staff have taken steps to improve in this area. In 2024, CNSC staff asked some of the licensees to provide effluent and environmental monitoring data in a machine- readable format, such as comma-separated values (CSV) files. This will make the data entry process more efficient.
	Based on the efforts made to-date, CNSC staff have not identified a need to initiate formal actions for this recommendation at this time.
Recommendation 5: Standardized terms and	CNSC staff do not accept this recommendation.
measurements (Page 18)	There are currently no standardized terms and measurements related to detection limits because there is no requirement for all licensees to standardize their terms and measurements related to detection limits. Therefore, this would have to be manually updated by the CNSC.
	Although this will be considered in the future as the regulatory framework evolves, CNSC staff have not



	identified a need to initiate formal actions for this
	identified a need to initiate formal actions for this
	recommendation at this time.
Recommendation 6: Estimated public dose could be reported in its own column (Page 18)	CNSC staff do not accept this recommendation.
	There is not a separate column with the estimated dose to
	public because the format of the spreadsheet is analogous
	with the NPRI spreadsheets.
	Based on this, CNSC staff have not identified a need to
	implement changes in this area or initiate formal actions for
	this recommendation at this time.
Recommendation 7: Cross-referencing	<u>CNSC staff do not accept this recommendation.</u>
radiological and non-radiological data for nuclear	
facilities on open government portal (Page 19)	CNSC staff note that the Open Government portal has a
	robust search engine. Therefore, the CNSC's data file
	uploads are easily searchable. CNSC staff also note that
	there are linkages between the NPRI portal and the CNSC's
	Open Government portal. A user searching for non-
	radionuclide releases from a CNSC-regulated facility on the
	NPRI portal will be directed to the CNSC Open Government
	portal where they can get the radionuclide releases.
	portal where they can get the radionuclide releases.
	Based on this, CNSC staff have not identified a need to
	implement changes in this area or initiate formal actions for
	this recommendation at this time.
Recommendation 8: Greater transparency	CNSC staff do not accept this recommendation.
around reporting non-routine releases (Page 19)	
	CNSC staff note that if a significant spill was to occur, it
	would be brought up to the Commission as an Event Initial
	Report (EIR) and would also be posted online on the CNSC
	and the licensee's website. This provides transparency
	around reporting non-routine releases.
	Based on this, CNSC staff have not identified a need to
	implement changes in this area or initiate formal actions for
	this recommendation at this time.
Recommendation 9: Adding regulatory limits to release values for context (Page 19)	CNSC staff do not accept this recommendation.
	There is not a separate column with the regulatory limits
	because the format of the spreadsheet is analogous with
	the NPRI spreadsheets. There are links to the CNSC RORs
	which have the regulatory limits for releases to the
	environment.
	Based on this, CNSC staff have not identified a need to
	implement changes in this area or initiate formal actions for
	this recommendation at this time.



December 40 Transfer (1)	
Recommendation 10: Transparency of dataset	CNSC staff do not accept this recommendation.
categories (Page 19)	
	Canadian Nuclear Laboratories (CNL) facilities have their
	own spreadsheet on the Open Government portal because
	they are presented together in the ROR. The CNL
	spreadsheet is meant to supplement the ROR. This allows
	the user to obtain all of the information related to the
	environmental protection safety and control area in one
	document.
	Based on this, CNSC staff have not identified a need to
	implement changes in this area or initiate formal actions for
1	this recommendation at this time.
Recommendations for additional data disclosure	
Recommendation 11: Including disaggregated	CNSC staff accept this recommendation.
environmental monitoring data (Page 20)	
	The current data displays the total radionuclides released
	to the environment, which was the original objective. CNSC
	staff have taken steps to improve in this area with
	discussions and plans to upload spreadsheets with detailed
	effluent and environmental monitoring data in the future.
	Based on this, CNSC staff have not identified a need to
	initiate formal actions for this recommendation at this time.
Recommendation 12: Including data relating to	CNSC staff accept this recommendation.
additional containment pathways (Page 20)	
	The current data displays the total radionuclides released
	to the environment, which was the original objective. CNSC
	staff have taken steps to improve in this area with
	discussions and plans to upload spreadsheets with
	environmental monitoring data, including ambient air,
	surface water, groundwater, and stormwater. In the
	meantime, the results of these environmental monitoring
	programs are often available in the licensee's annual
	environment reports, which are publicly available on the
	licensee's website or by making a request to the licensee.
	Pased on this CNSC staff have not identified a need to
	Based on this, CNSC staff have not identified a need to
December 12: Content in lining	initiate formal actions for this recommendation at this time.
Recommendation 13: Contextualizing	CNSC staff accept this recommendation.
Independent Environmental Monitoring Program	
data (Page 20)	CNSC staff have taken steps to improve in this area. The
	CNSC's Independent Environmental Monitoring Program
	(IEMP) objectives have been revised to emphasize that the
	IEMP builds Indigenous and public trust and the results add
	to the body of evidence that the environment is protected.



	Based on the efforts made to-date, CNSC staff have not
	identified a need to initiate formal actions for this
	recommendation at this time.
Recommendation 14: Disclosures and protocols	CNSC staff accept this recommendation.
that observe and respect Indigenous data	choc stan accept this recommendation.
sovereignty (Page 21)	The CNSC acknowledges the importance of working with, considering and reflecting Indigenous Knowledge alongside regulatory information in its assessments and regulatory processes. The CNSC's Indigenous Knowledge Policy Framework outlines the CNSC's best practices for working with, protecting, validating, and understanding Indigenous knowledge. The CNSC's approach to working with, reflecting and protecting Indigenous Knowledge is outlined
	in the CNSC's reconciliation framework. Based on the efforts made to-date, CNSC staff have not identified a need to initiate formal actions for this recommendation at this time.
Recommendation 15: Greater clarity of nuclear data disclosure scope and the work of this task	CNSC staff do not accept this recommendation.
force (Page 21)	Transportation data, economic data and sociological data will not be posted due to confidentiality reasons or because they are outside of the CNSC's mandate. Power Reactor Operating Licences (PROLs) and Licence Conditions Handbooks (LCHs) may be posted online in the future. In the meantime, the public can request a copy of the licence and the LCH by making a request through the CNSC Info account.
	Based on this, CNSC staff have not identified a need to initiate formal actions for this recommendation at this time.

CONCLUSION

Based on the review of all NTP recommendations in the submission, CNSC staff conclude that no changes to regulatory requirements or station specific actions were required based on the recommendations. Responses consisting of a brief explanation of the CNSC processes and/or practices currently in effect for the subjects discussed are deemed sufficient to address NTP's comments and expand on the reason for response for each recommendation. Although CNSC staff indicate in their responses to some of the recommendations that it will be taken into consideration moving forward, no additional formal actions are proposed at this time.

For the recommendations directed at Bruce Power, CNSC staff did not identify any concerns related to nuclear safety or with Bruce Power's compliance in the areas of public information and disclosure and environmental data reporting. Therefore, based on the review of each recommendation described in Table 1, CNSC staff conclude that there is no need to place any expectations on Bruce Power at this time, and they can take the NTP recommendations under advisement as they see fit.



CNSC staff acknowledge and value the Nuclear Transparency Project's (NTP) participation and interest in the Bruce Power Mid-term Update of Licensed Activities Commission Meeting on September 20, 2023.

Acknowledgement of concurrence with Director General decision:

I approve

10/8/2024

X Ramzi Jammal

Ramzi Jammal Executive Vice-President and CROO Signed by: Jammal, Ramzi

Ramzi Jammal Executive Vice-President and CROO

I do not approve

Prepared by Anupama Bulkan, Regulatory Program Director-Bruce Regulatory Program Division

References

[1] "CMD 23-M27.29, Written submission from the Nuclear Transparency Project – Bruce Power Mid-term Update of Licensed Activities", e-Doc 7101178.

[2] "Minutes of the Canadian Nuclear Safety Commission (CNSC) Meeting held on September 20-21, 2023", e-Doc 7166879.

[3] "Transcript of September 20, 2023, Public Meeting Bruce Power Midterm", e-Doc 7137757.